Cover of Charles Andreas No.	
COURT OF CRIMINAL APPEALS NO	
APPEAL TO ALABAMA COURT O	F CRIMINAL APPEALS
FROM	
CIRCUIT COURT OF MONTGOMERY	COUNTY, ALABAMA
CIRCUIT COURT NO. CC 99-327	
CIRCUIT JUDGESALLY GREEN	HAW
Type of Conviction / Order Appealed From:STALKING Sentence Imposed: _20_years	
Defendant Indigent: X YES NO	
	John Willie Minnifield
JOSEPH BURKHART 262-4800	NAME OF APPELLANT
(Appellant's Attorney) Street Suite 206 (Telephone No.)	
Montgomery, AL 36104	
(City) (State) (Zip Code)	
<b>v.</b>	
STATE OF ALABAMA	
(State represented by Attorney General)	NAME OF APPELLEE
NOTE: If municipal appeal, indicate above, and enter	•

(For Court of Criminal Appeals Use Only)

name and address of municipal attorney below.

1	IN THE CIRCUIT COURT
2	OF
3	MONTGOMERY COUNTY, ALABAMA
4	
5	State of Alabama,
6	Plaintiff,
7	vs. CASE NO: CC-99-327
8	JOHN WILLIE MINNIFIELD,
9	Defendant.
1.0	Defendant.  Defendant.  Defendant.
11	
12	15 05 67 87 TT.
13	* * * * * * * * *
1.4	PROCEEDINGS in the above-styled
15	cause before the Honorable Sally M. Greenhaw,
16	Presiding Judge, in Courtroom 3-C, Montgomery
17	County Circuit Court, 251 South Lawrence Street,
18	Montgomery, Alabama, commencing on Monday, January
19	10 and February 7, 2000.
20	* * * * * * * * *
21	
22	
2 3	
24	
25	Meridith D. Newman, CSR Official Court Reporter

1.	APPEARANCES
2	
3	
4	FOR THE STATE:
5	Mr. Daryl Bailey Montgomery County District Attorney
6	251 South Lawrence Street  Montgomery, Alabama 36104
7	Montegomery, Arabama 30104
8	FOR THE DEFENDANT:
9	Mr. John Wiley Hartley Attorney at Law
10	312 Scott Street Montgomery, Alabama 36104
11	
12	Also Mr. Minnifield went pro se.
13	* * * * * * * * *
1.4	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

	. 3
1	TRIAL INDEX
2	
3	COURT'S OPENING REMARKS 44
4	OPENING STATEMENTS
5	WITNESSES FOR THE STATE:
6	CLEMMITHA PETACE
7	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 70 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 73
8	PETE ROSE
9	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 75 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 81
10	VONCIEL MINNIFIELD
11	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 87 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 120
12	REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY . 135
13	G. L. SISSON DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 138
14	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 143
15	ROSEBUD BROWN DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 147
16	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 153
17	LAWANDA BENSON DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 157
18	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 171
19	LESTER GLAXTON DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 181
20	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 185
21	TIMOTHY BROWN, JR. DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 190
22	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 194
23	ASHLEY ELIZA COOK DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 198
24	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 202
25	

_		
1	DANA COOK	
2	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 208 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 214	
2.	REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY . 220	
3	NICHOLAS WASHINGTON	
4	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 223	
5	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD . 227	
D	WITNESSES FOR THE DEFENDANT:	-
6	SHERRY MELTON	
7	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD 236	
8	JOHNNIE SULLIVAN	
9	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD 243 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 245	
	KARINI DI ANGU	
10	KAREN BLANCH DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD 246	
11	RONNIE WATERS	
12	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD 249	
13	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 253	
13	GLORIS PERDO	
14	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. MINNIFIELD 254 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 258	
15		
16	JOHN MINNIFIELD  EXAMINATION OF HIMSELF 261	,
7.0	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 280	
17	EXAMINATION OF HIMSELF 288	
18	REBUTTAL FOR THE STATE	
19	CASSANDRA WILLIAMS DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BAILEY 296	-
20	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. BRIDGE 250	
21	CLOSING ARGUMENTS	
22	JURY CHARGE	
23	VERDICT	
24	SENTENCING	
25		

2.3

THE COURT: Good morning. Y'all can be seated. I'm Judge Sally Greenhaw, and we're about to start a case. It's a criminal case, and it's the State of Alabama versus John Minnifield. Mr. Minnifield is charged with stalking a Vonciel Minnifield by allegedly following, harassing, or threatening her, which is alleged to have occurred back in the fall of '98 in the vicinity of 770 Washington Avenue around the RSA Plaza. And I'm mentioning that to you because I'm going to ask you shortly if you know or if you've heard anything about the case.

But before I do that, I'm going to introduce you to everyone seated at counsel table. The State today is represented by Daryl Bailey and seated next to him is Vonciel Minnifield. And down at this end is John Minnifield and his attorney, Wiley Hartley. And now that I've introduced them to you, it's going to be a good time for you to introduce yourselves to us. I know this information is on your questionnaire, but it's a good time for the attorneys to put your face with your questionnaire. When the clerk calls your name, if you would please stand. If you're employed, tell us where. If you're married, where your spouse is employed. Or

1	if you're retired lucky enough to be retired
2	the occupation from which you're retired, and that
3	would also apply to your spouse.
4	THE CLERK: Richard Lamkin.
5	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is
6	Richard Lamkin. I'm employed by Sears Roebuck and
. 7	Company. My wife is a housewife.
8	THE CLERK: Dorothy Lee.
9	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is
10	Dorothy Lee. I'm employed by the Board of
11	Education and also Dairy Queen.
12	THE CLERK: Heather Leonard.
13	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Heather
14	Leonard. I'm a self-employed counselor, and my
15	husband is employed by Alabama Crown Distributing
16	Company.
17	THE CLERK: Rachelle Leslie.
18	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Rachelle
19	Leslie. I'm employed with Regions Bank, and my
20	husband is employed with Friedman's Jewelry.
21	THE CLERK: Sarah Lewis.
22	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is Sarah
23	Lewis. I'm employed at True Divine Daycare I
24	teach a daycare at True Divine on Virginia Loop
25	Road. My husband is the produce manager of the
	1

1	Calhoun Foods.
2	THE CLERK: Linda Livingston.
3	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is Linda
4	Livingston. I'm currently unemployed. My husband
5	is on an operator line originating from Decampton,
6	California.
7	THE CLERK: Henry Longmire.
8	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Henry
9	Longmire employed with Charles Trucking Company.
10 .	My wife is employed with Russell Incorporation.
11	THE CLERK: Claudia Lowe.
12	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Claudia
1.3	Lowe, and I teach second grade, and I'm single.
14	THE CLERK: Gwendolyn Lusane.
15	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Gwendolyn
16	Lusane. I'm single. I'm employed temporary with
17	Unclaimed Property.
18	THE CLERK: Wanda Mack.
19	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Wanda Mack.
20	I'm employed with Macon County Board of Education.
21	I'm a kindergarten teacher. And my husband works
22	for the Department of Youth Services.
23	THE CLERK: Frances Mangum.
24	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Pronounced
25	Mangum. Frances Mangum. I'm retired AT&T, and I'm

1 .	a widow.
2	THE CLERK: Yuri Manuel.
3 .	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Yuri Manuel,
4	employed (inaudible.)
5	THE CLERK: Joellen Marshall.
6	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Joellen
7	Marshall. I'm employed by Venture Travel, and my
8	husband is with Liberty International.
9	THE CLERK: Charlie Martin.
10	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is
11	Charlie Martin. I'm employed by Longforce Baptist
12	Church, and my wife is employed by Macon East
13	Montgomery Academy.
14	THE CLERK: Roger Martin.
15	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Roger
16	Martin. I'm employed Retirement Systems of
17	Alabama, and I'm single.
18	THE CLERK: James McIndoe.
19	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: McIndoe. James
20	McIndoe. I'm employed by the State of Alabama,
21	Department of Environmental Management, and my wife
22	is a housewife.
23	THE CLERK: Gwendolyn McKenney.
24	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Gwendolyn
25	McKenney. I'm employed by the State of Alabama,

1	Department of Transportation. My husband is
2	employed with the Montgomery County Board of
3	Education and the City of Montgomery.
4 .	THE CLERK: Lilian McNiven.
.5	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Lilian
6	McNiven. I'm a housewife, and my husband is
7	employed in St. Louis with Flight Safety
8	International.
9	THE CLERK: John Mitchell.
10	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is John
11	Mitchell. I'm employed by Montgomery Board of
12	Education.
13	THE CLERK: Sharon Neely.
14	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is
15	Sharon Neely. I'm single, and I work for Bylaw
16	Communications.
17	THE CLERK: Edward Ogwynn.
18	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm employed by
19	Wilson Price Barranco, and Billingsley in
20	Montgomery. My wife is a housewife.
21	THE CLERK: Catherine Ortega.
2 2	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Ortega.
23	Catherine Ortega. I'm single, and I work for the
2 4	State of Alabama, Department of Youth Services.
25	THE CLERK: Daisy Patton.

1.	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Daisy Patton.
2	I'm retired and a widow.
3	THE CLERK: David Penn.
4	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is David
5	Penn. I work full-time for the Alabama National
6	Guard, and my wife is a homemaker.
7	THE CLERK: Nellie Perry.
8	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is
9	Nellie Perry. I work were the U.S. Postal
10	Service, and I'm divorced.
11	THE CLERK: Lee Peters.
12	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Lee Peters.
13	I'm divorced, and I work part-time on weekends
14	nursing doing private nursing.
15	THE CLERK: Lawrence Phipps.
16	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Lawrence
17	Phipps. I'm employed by Longforce Baptist Church,
18	and my wife is the weekly preschool director at
19	Longforce Baptist Church.
20	THE CLERK: Donald Porter.
21	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Donald
22	Porter. I'm retired from civil service, computer
23	specialist. Currently doing part-time work for
24	Capital Chevrolet as a courtesy driver, and my wife
25	works as a court specialist in family court.

1	THE CLERK: Mary Pouncey.
2	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Mary
3	Pouncey. I'm a retired Federal employee, and I'm a
4	widow.
5 .	THE CLERK: Telissa Preston.
6	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is
7	Telissa Preston. I'm employed by Kim Baking
8	Industry.
9	THE CLERK: Lori Pritchett.
10	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm Lori
1,1	Pritchett. I work for Regions Financial Corp; and
12	my husband is employed with Knology, Incorporated.
13	THE CLERK: Franklin Reynolds.
14	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Frank Reynolds.
15	I currently work for Yellow Freight System,
16	tractor-trailer operator. Also general
17	firefighter. My wife is a bank employee at Regions
18	Bank.
19	THE CLERK: That's it, Judge.
20	THE COURT: Okay. I'm going to
21	be excuse me, that time of the year. I'm going
22	to be asking some questions. If anyone needs to
23.	respond, if you would please stand, give your name
24	again and any details that may be helpful.
25	When I refer to family members, I'm referring

```
to someone in your immediate family, your spouse,
 1
 2
       children, grandchildren, brother, sisters, parents,
       or grandparents. Or if there's a particular close
 3
       friend that you think it would be helpful for the
 4
       attorneys to have that information about, that
 5
       would be okay as well.
 б
            I've introduced you to everyone seated at
 7
       counsel table. And now I'm going to ask the same
 8
       question about each of them. And I'll start again
 9
       with Daryl Bailey. Is anyone here related to him
10
      by blood or marriage or know Mr. Bailey?
11
                      (No response.)
12
                      THE COURT: Our DA in Montgomery
13
       County is Ellen Brooks. Anyone know Ms. Brooks or
14
       related to her by blood or marriage?
15
                      (No response.)
16
                      THE COURT: I'm not going to repeat
17
       the same question, but what I need to know about
18
       all of the people at counsel table or witnesses is
19
       if you do know any of them or related to them.
20
       And, again, down at this end is Vonciel Minnifield.
21
                      (No response.)
22
                      THE COURT: And at this end is John
23
       Minnifield and his attorney, John Wiley Hartley.
24
                      (No response.)
25
```

```
THE COURT: And I'm going to go over
٦
      a number of witnesses who may be called and, again,
 2
      if you know any of them --
 3
                      (Juror raises hand.)
                      MR. HARTLEY: Judge --
5
                      THE COURT: Okay.
 6
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Judge, my name
 7
      is Edward Ogwynn. I know the defendant. He worked
 8
      for our firm.
 9
                      THE COURT: Okay. We may need to
10
      talk to you in private.
11
           Anyone else?
12
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Excuse me, you
13
       asked about Ellen Brooks.
14
                      THE COURT: Yes, ma'am.
15
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My name is Lee
16
      Peters. I nurse her aunt.
17
                      THE COURT: Okay. So you would just
18
19
      know her -- you don't visit --
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I don't know her
20
      personally, no.
21
                      THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.
22
            I'm going to read out a number of potential
23
      witnesses. They probably will not all testify, but
24
       I need to know if you do know them or related. And
25
```

```
1
       some of their names just may be mentioned during
 2.
       the course of the trial. If you're not sure
       whether you know anyone, the attorneys may be able
 3
       to help us out about where they work or live. But
 4
       these are potential witnesses. Tim Brown?
 5
 6
                       (No response.)
 7
                       THE COURT: Rosebud Brown?
 8
                       (No response.)
 9
                       THE COURT: Ashley Cook?
10
                       (No response.)
11
                       THE COURT: Elester Claxton?
12
                       (No response.)
13
                       THE COURT: Lawanda Benson?
14
                       (No response.)
                       THE COURT: Nicolas Washington?
15
16
                       (No response.)
17
                       THE COURT: Pete Rose -- not the
18
       baseball player.
19
                       (No response.)
20
                       THE COURT: Cassandra Williams?
21
                       (No response.)
22
                      THE COURT: G. L. Sisson?
23
                       (No response.)
24
                      THE COURT: Glemmitha Petace?
25
                      (No response.)
```

1	THE COURT: Johnnie Sullivan?
2	(No response.)
3	THE COURT: Ronnie Waters?
4	(No response.)
5	THE COURT: J. L. Harris?
6	(No response.)
7	THE COURT: Dana Cook.
8	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I work with Dana
9	Cook occasionally.
10	THE COURT: Okay. Wait just a
11	minute. Is it on a daily basis or
12	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No. She's on my
13	floor. She is in my building.
14	MR. BAILEY: Judge, Dana Cook is
15	Ms. Minnifield's daughter. She's a juvenile. I
16	don't think it's the same one.
17	THE COURT: It's probably not the
18	same one. Thank you.
19	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: What about
20	Johnnie Sullivan?
21	THE COURT: He has the restaurant
22	he has restaurants. Is that the same one?
23	MR. HARTLEY: Yes, Judge.
24	THE COURT: Okay. And do you know
25	him?

```
1
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Yes.
 2
                      THE COURT: Is it of a patron of the
 3
       restaurant or --
 4
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Well, I've known
 5
       him pretty much all my life.
 6
                      THE COURT: Okay. So you've just
 7
       known him through the years? Do you visit in each
      other's home?
 8
 9
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: (Prospective
       juror nods.)
10
11
                      THE COURT: And he may be more of a
       character witness. I don't know for either side.
12
13
       Will he be a fact witness as well?
                      MR. HARTLEY: I think he
14
15
       characterizes, Judge, mostly character.
                      THE COURT: Well, let me just ask,
16
       that you know him, would you give his testimony any
17
       more weight than anyone else simply because you
18
       know him?
19
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I don't think
20
21
       so.
                      THE COURT: So you could sit
2.2
       impartially on this jury?
23
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Sure.
24
                      THE COURT: Ed Excites. I think
25
```

1	he's also in the restaurant business and may be
2	there at the RSA Plaza. And you're nodding. Do
3	you know him also just
4	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I know Ronnie
5	Waters as well.
6	THE COURT: And does he work there
7	too?
8	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: They're in the
9	restaurant.
10	THE COURT: Do you know them simply
11	as a patron or do you visit in each other's home?
12	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I have socially,
13	you know, been with them. But it's no big
14	relationship. I just know who they are.
15	THE COURT: Okay. Would it just be
16	on occasion at somewhere there would be quite a
17	number of other people present?
18	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Right.
1.9	THE COURT: And, again, their
20,	testimony may be more in the nature rather than a
21	fact witness as to what they observed. I don't
22	know, but more of a character witness. Would that
23	be correct?
24	MR. HARTLEY: Judge, they may know
25	some facts depending on how far the case goes.

1	MR. BAILEY: Mr. Waters would be the
2	only fact witness out of those that you called.
3	THE COURT: Well, that you know
4	them, would that
5	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I just know
6	who I've just been with them a couple of times.
7	It's not major relation.
8.	THE COURT: That would not have any
9	impact with you sitting on this jury?
10	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Not at all.
11	THE COURT: Is this Gloria or Glen
12	Purdue?
13	THE DEFENDANT: Gloris.
14	THE COURT: Okay.
15	(No response.)
16	THE COURT: Karen Carter Branch,
17	Kitty Carter, and Keisha Carter?
18	(No response.)
19	THE COURT: Don Thomason, Thomas
20	Hicks, Joy Dennington, and Sherry Milton?
21	(No response.)
22	THE COURT: Have I overlooked are
23	there any other potential witnesses?
24	MR. HARTLEY: I don't think so,
25	Judge.

1 THE COURT: Has anyone here heard 2 anything whatsoever about the facts or circumstances surrounding the case? 3 4 (Juror stands.) PROSPECTIVE JUROR: And you 5 mentioned that you knew him, and we'll talk with 6 7 you briefly. 8 THE COURT: Has anyone here or 9 anyone in your immediate family -- I don't think, though, that we have any police -- do we have any 10 police officers testifying? 11 12 MR. BAILEY: Yes, Your Honor. There's a Cassandra Williams --13 14 THE COURT: Okay. 15 MR. BAILEY: -- Detective Williams, 16 who is now with the Alabama State Troopers, and J. L. Sisson, who is with the Montgomery Police 17 18 Department and Officer --19 THE COURT: Okay. Well, there are a 20 number. I know you've already given -- told information on your questionnaire about past 21 22 contact or employment with police or law 23 enforcement agencies. There are going to be some police officers testifying. Would anyone here 24 automatically give a police officer or law 25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

. 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

21

enforcement officer's testimony more weight than you would any other witness simply because of the position they hold?

(No response.)

THE COURT: Does anyone here have any interest whatsoever in the conviction or acquittal of defendant or made any promises or given any assurance that he or she will convict or acquit?

(No response.)

THE COURT: Does anyone here have a fixed opinion as to the quilt or innocence of the defendant which would bias your verdict?

(No response.)

THE COURT: The next question, if you had rather not answer in front of everyone, we probably -- we'll probably need to talk to a couple of you in private anyway -- but I do need to know if anyone in your immediate family has been charged with or a victim such as stalking. And I would include that to mean any type of domestic -- this matter does -- in fact, I think the parties are still married at this time. But a domestics type relation -- if you've ever been charged with or convicted of any offense that would arise out of

```
1
       that type situation or stalking or harassment?
 2
                      (Juror raises hand.)
                      THE COURT: And had you rather talk
 3
       to us in private?
 4
                      (Juror nods.)
 5
                      THE COURT: I'll let anyone talk
       with us in just a moment. Just stay in here.
 7
            Mr. Bailey, do you have additional questions?
 8
 9
                  MR. BAILEY: Just a few, if I may,
10
      Your Honor?
            Of course, Your Honor has stated, I'm Daryl
11
12
      Bailey, and I represent the State of Alabama in
       this case. I work for Ellen Brooks, who is the
13
       district attorney for Montgomery County. And I am
14
15
       the deputy district attorney for Montgomery County.
16
      As Judge Greenhaw has stated, this case is about
17
       stalking. And I just want to ask you a few
       questions. And if any of you don't feel
18
      comfortable answering these questions amongst the
19
      whole group, if you would, please just say after
20
21
      you're dismissed, and we'll talk to you at that
      time. Is there anyone here in this group -- I'm
22
       sorry, ma'am?
23
24
                      (Juror raises hand.)
25
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm sorry.
```

```
think I know him -- I think I know you. Is your
 1
       wife Tracey Bailey?
                      MR. BAILEY: (Attorney nods.)
 3
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I know him -- I
 4
       know his wife.
 5
                      THE COURT: You must not know him
 6
       too well.
 7
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I've seen you
 8
       once, but I work with your wife. I don't know if
. 9
       that's a problem or not.
10
                      THE COURT: Would that have any
11
       impact with you sitting on this jury?
12
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I don't think
13
14
       so.
                      THE COURT: We would -- you don't
15
       see him on a regular basis and you don't visit with
16
17
       him?
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No, ma'am.
18
                      THE COURT: Okay.
19
                      MR. BAILEY: Is there anyone here in
20
       this group that would need to be one hundred
21
       percent sure that the defendant committed the crime
22
       of stalking in this case or in any case before you
23
      would be willing to convict?
24
                      THE COURT: Let me say this.
25
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

any -- if you're selected for the jury, the Court is going to charge you on reasonable doubt. And I think that's what Mr. Bailey is going to get into. But there will be certain standards, and that will be explained to you, the burden of proof. Go ahead.

MR. BAILEY: Is there anyone that would have to be convinced a hundred percent sure that a defendant committed a crime before you would convict?

(No response.)

MR. BAILEY: Anybody? And it's all right if you feel that way. Mr. Hartley and I just need to know the answers. Does everyone, then, realize that the standard of proof in this criminal case and every other criminal case that's ever been tried in this country is beyond a reasonable doubt? It's not beyond all doubt, but beyond a reasonable doubt. And the Judge, as she just stated, is going to instruct you on that at the end of this case.

But in order for someone to be a hundred percent sure that someone committed a crime, you would have had to have been a witness of the crime and, therefore, that would disqualify you as serving as a juror. Does everyone understand that?

1 (No response.) MR. BAILEY: Is there anyone in this 2 venire, this group, that has a problem of sitting 3 in judgment of another person, whether it be for 4 religious reasons or any other type reason? Do you 5 have a problem judging another person on acts that 6 they may have committed? 7 (No response.) 8 MR. BAILEY: I know some of you may 9 have mentioned that in your questionnaire. Yes, 1.0 11 sir? PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I don't really 12 like to judge people myself, but it all depends on 13 the situation. 14 THE COURT: Can you stand up? 15 has to take everything down -- and are you 16 Mrs. Manuel. 17 PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I don't really 18 like to judge nobody, but it depends on the 19 20 situation. THE COURT: Well, let me ask this. 21 As a juror, if you're selected, you'll be sworn in 22 to do your duty. Could you put aside briefly, for 23

these purposes, your personal opinions and be able

to sit on this jury?

24

25

PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Yeah. 1 Okay. Go ahead. THE COURT: 2 MR. BAILEY: Is there anyone else 3 that feels that way, feels that you would have a 4 problem of sitting in judgment of another person? 5 If you're selected as a juror, that's what you 6 would be asked to do. Anyone else? 7 (No response.) 8 MR. BAILEY: Do any of you have any 9 type of personal beliefs? And, again, this can be 10 personal beliefs or religious beliefs, or any other 11 beliefs that would prevent you from finding the 12 defendant guilty in a criminal case if you were 13 convinced beyond a reasonable doubt. Anybody have 14 any type of beliefs that would prevent you from 15 doing that? 16 (No response.) 17 MR. BAILEY: Okay. Is there anyone 1.8 here in this group that has negative feelings about 19 the Montgomery Police Department, got a speeding 20 ticket you didn't think you deserved or just don't 21 like police officers --22 THE COURT: Don't ask that or for 23 some other reason. 24 MR. BAILEY: Is there anyone here 25

1.

2.3

that has negative feelings about the Montgomery
Police Department or any other law enforcement
department for that matter?

(No response.)

MR. BAILEY: No one has any negative feelings about the police department? Okay.

Anyone here that have any negative feelings -and the reason I'm asking this -- I noticed a lot
of you put on your questionnaires that you were
victims of crimes. Is there anyone that has any
negative feelings or negative dealings with the
district attorney's office, with Ellen Brooks or
any previous district attorney's office?

(No response.)

MR. BAILEY: Do -- and I know that quite of few of you are going to answer in the affirmative to this question. But do any of you regularly watch court television or any other shows which commonly depict court situations? And that's not only court TV, but Judge Judy and other things of that nature.

(Jurors raise hands.)

MR. BAILEY: Probably quite a few of you watch that. Those that have answered that you do watch that, do you understand that the laws that

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

are depicted on those TV shows may not be the same law as it is here in Alabama? And some of those, like in Law and Order and shows like that, may not be the law anywhere. Does everyone understand that?

(Jurors nod.)

MR. BAILEY: Judge, I believe that's all the questions I have at this time.

THE COURT: Mr. Hartley?

MR. HARTLEY: Thank you, Judge.

I guess one of the most common criticisms of lawyers is that they repeat things, and I'm fixing to start off by repeating something that y'all heard just a minute ago, but it won't take but one question. And when Judge Greenhaw was asking y'all general questions, I want to reiterate that point that she made at the very last about whether or not anyone in this panel, you know, or someone you're related to was a victim of possible stalking. And I want y'all to remember that. It will be a matter that can be brought up in a one-by-one basis after we adjourn back to the jury assembly room. But I want y'all to think broadly about that because the stalking area of law is one of those things that kind of has some vaque orders on it. So if you

might have had some connection with an issue involving stalking in your life, and it might be relevant to this case, I sure would like to ask you to stay and tell us about it so we can weigh it in how it might affect you being a potential juror. I think y'all heard the Judge do it -- ask you the question, and she did an excellent job, but she made it sort of compound. And I want to ask anybody that may have had that type of thing in their life to please stay with us and let us find out about it. That's the only thing I wanted to repeat. Thank you.

THE COURT: Okay. Let me see the attorneys for just a minute.

I know, Mr. Ogwynn, we're going to need to talk with you. And, I think, Ms. Lee, you also raised your hand. And if anyone else is going to need to stay in here, you can also.

Is there anyone y'all need to talk to?

MR. BAILEY: Other than those you have, no, ma'am.

THE COURT: At this time, I'm going to let all of you, except the two I called -- and if there's anyone else that for some reason you

```
want to talk with us in private about a matter, if
1
      you'll stay in here as well.
2
            The rest of you, I'm going to let go. It will
3
       probably be about thirty minutes, and we'll try to
 4
       let you know who's going to be on this jury. We'll
 5
      keep you posted. You can go back to the jury
 6
       assembly room.
 7
                      (Out of the presence of the jury.)
 8
                      (In the presence of Mr. Edward
 9
                      Oqwynn.)
1.0
                      THE COURT: Mr. Ogwynn, you
11
       indicated that Mr. Minnifield worked for your firm?
12
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Uh-huh.
13
                      THE COURT: So do you know something
14
       or have you heard something about the case or --
15
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Uh-huh.
16
                      THE COURT: -- maybe the entire
1.7
18
       situation?
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I have.
19
                      THE COURT: And that may pose a
20
       problem because you do have some -- whether it's
21
       correct or incorrect -- some information about it,
22
       and I'm sure it might have been discussed even at
23
       the office at times?
24
                       PROSPECTIVE JUROR:
                                           It has.
25
```

1	THE COURT: And I don't know that
2	you would be able to serve on this jury. Do you
3	want
4	MR. BAILEY: We would make a motion
5	to
6	MR. HARTLEY: Judge, I would like to
.7	ask him some questions before the Court rules on
8	that motion.
9	Mr. Ogwynn, would you be able to set aside
10	whatever you've heard and act as a fair and
11	impartial juror and decide the case only on what
12	was presented in the courtroom? Would that be
13	possible for you to do that?
14	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Well, I've known
15	John Minnifield for three years and, you know, I
16	think I could do that, but him being a friend of
17	mine, I'm not comfortable.
.18	MR. HARTLEY: Okay. So it's more
19	than you've just seen him. You actually feel like
20	you have a relationship?
21	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Well, he worked
22	for us for three years.
23	MR. HARTLEY: Judge, I
24	THE COURT: And we understand it
25	would be a difficult. And I'm going to go ahead
	1

```
and excuse you. If you would ask Mr. Merrill what
 1
       you need to do.
 2
 3
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Okay. Thank
       you.
 4
                      (Mr. Edward Ogwynn excused.)
 5
 6
                      (In the presence of Ms. Lee Peters.)
 7
                      THE COURT: Okay. Ms. Peters, what
       did you need to bring to our attention?
 8
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I was stalked
. 9
       one time, and I had to go to a lawyer to get it
1.0
       stopped, but that's been a long time ago.
1 1
12
                      THE COURT: How long ago was it?
13
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Say, eighteen
14
       years.
15
                      THE COURT: Was it someone you knew
16
       personally or --
17
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: My ex-husband.
                      THE COURT: Your ex-husband?
18
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Uh-huh.
19
20
                      THE COURT: And did it go to court?
21
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No. We -- he
22
       settled it -- my lawyer settled it.
23
                      THE COURT: So you never filed
24
       charges against him?
25
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No, huh-uh.
```

1	went and talked to my lawyer, and he said, Let me
2	talk to him and see if we can keep it out of court.
.3	It had been going on for three or four or five
4	years, I reckon. Everywhere I go, he would follow
5	me and make a scene. And I get home, and he would
6	be sitting on the doorsteps making a scene. You
7	know, just harassment
8	THE COURT: You know, that
9	evidentially occurred over a number of years. Can
10	you put that out of your mind and give the
11	defendant here just as fair a trial as you would
12	the State?
13	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Yeah, because
14	there are two sides.
15	MR. HARTLEY: May I ask?
16	THE COURT: Do you have any
17	questions?
18	MR. BAILEY: I don't have any
19	questions.
20	MR. HARTLEY: Let me ask, suppose
21	the evidence in this case after a lot of evidence
22	came down to a very, very close call on the issue
23	of his guilt or innocence on the issue of stalking.
24	Do you think that your experience might make you
25	prone to possibly lean more toward the side of the

1	State or the victim because you, yourself, were a
2	victim?
3	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No.
4	MR. HARTLEY: Are you absolutely
5.	certain?
6	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Uh-huh.
7	MR. HARTLEY: Okay.
8	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I mean, either
9	you do or you don't. Right is right and wrong is
10	wrong. If it's right, I'm for it. If it's wrong,
11	then I'm against it.
12	MR. HARTLEY: Yes, ma'am. But would
13	your experiences possibly make you lean
14	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No.
15	MR. HARTLEY: because you were
16	the victim yourself of stalking as you believe it
17	to be?
18	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No. It's like a
19	bad dream. With time you push it out of your mind.
20	THE COURT: But it wouldn't have any
21	impact
22	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No, ma'am.
23	MR. HARTLEY: And also, your
24	association with Ms. Brooks' aunt would not have
25	any effect

1	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I don't even
2	know her or her daddy or mother. I know who they
3	are.
4	MR. HARTLEY: Yes, ma'am.
5	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: And that's all.
6	THE COURT: Thank you for letting us
7	know. If you'll go back to the jury assembly room.
8	(Out of the presence of Ms. Peters.)
9	MR. HARTLEY: Judge, just for the
10	record, I would like to object on that last case
11	because of what she said and the fact
12	THE COURT: Well, I'm going to take
13	that up
14	(In the presence of Ms. Dorothy
15	Lee.)
16	THE COURT: Ms. Lee, you raised your
17	hand and indicated you needed to bring something to
18	our attention, and we needed to know.
19	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Okay. When you
20	asked about stalking, I've had a sister in that
21	case.
22	THE COURT: And when did that occur?
23	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: That has
24	occurred recent within the last year.
25	THE COURT: Does it involve someone

```
1
       she knows or a stranger or --
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Her husband.
 2
                      THE COURT: Her husband?
 3
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: (Prospective
 4
       juror nods.)
 5
                  THE COURT: Are they still married?
 6
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No. They're
 7
       divorced.
 8
 9
                      THE COURT: Has she -- has it gone
       to court over any --
10
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Yeah, they have
11
12
       gone to court.
                      THE COURT: You said they were
13
       divorced. Was this something that was addressed in
14
15
       the divorce matter or did she bring separate
       charges?
16
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Well, it was
17
       separate charges because they was divorced when it
18
1.9
       happened.
                      THE COURT: Okay. Would that have
20.
       any impact on you sitting on this jury? And I
21
       really want to know can you give Mr. Minnifield a
2.2
       fair trial with what has happened with your sister?
23
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Yes, I can.
24
                      THE COURT: So you can put that out
25
```

1	of your way and it wouldn't have any impact on this
2	case?
3	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Yes.
4	THE COURT: Mr. Bailey?
5	MR. BAILEY: No questions.
6	MR. HARTLEY: I would just like to
7	ask you, suppose after hearing all the testimony,
. 8	it seemed to be a very, very close call on
9	Mr. Minnifield as to being guilty or not guilty.
10	Do you think that your experience that you went
11	through that was actually your sister's
12	experience could have any possible bearing on
13	you maybe being more likely to find him guilty than
14	not guilty?
15	MR. HARTLEY: No.
16	MR. HARTLEY: And you're absolutely
17	certain on that?
18	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm certain.
18	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I'm certain.  MR. HARTLEY: Okay.
19	MR. HARTLEY: Okay.
19	MR. HARTLEY: Okay.  THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am. You
19 20 21	MR. HARTLEY: Okay.  THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am. You  can go back to the jury assembly room.
19 20 21 22	MR. HARTLEY: Okay.  THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am. You  can go back to the jury assembly room.  (Out of the presence of Ms. Dorothy

```
other two jurors?
 1
                      THE LAW CLERK: Judge, we have one
 2
 3
       more.
                      THE COURT: Oh, we do? Okay.
 4
                      MR. HARTLEY: Yeah, I was going to
 5
       move to exclude Ms. Lee Peters.
                      (In the presence of Ms. Catherine
 7
                      Ortega.)
 8
                      THE COURT: And you're Ms. Ortega?
 9
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Uh-huh.
10
                      THE COURT: What did you need to
1.1
12
       bring to our attention?
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I have two
13
       boyfriends in the past that wouldn't let go, so I
14
       didn't -- I don't think it would make me impartial,
15
       but --
16
                      THE COURT: Well, did you file any
17
       charges against either one of them?
18
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No.
19
                      THE COURT: How long ago was that?
20
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: 1992.
21
                      THE COURT: You said both --
22
23
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: One was in '92
       and one was in '86.
24
                      THE COURT: So it's been some time
25
```

1	ago?
2	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Yeah, some time.
3	THE COURT: And you didn't bring any
4	type charges?
5	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No.
6	THE COURT: Whatever occurred to
7	you, could you put that aside and
8 .	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Yeah. I don't
9	think it would make me impartial, but I just
10	THE COURT: Okay. In other words,
11	are you telling the Court you can give
12	Mr. Minnifield just a fair trial as you can the
13	State?
14 ,	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Uh-huh.
15	THE COURT: Mr. Bailey?
16	MR. BAILEY: No questions.
17	MR. HARTLEY: I would like to ask
18	the same question and I usually phrase it like
19	this. Suppose the evidence came down very close,
20	the evidence almost equal on both sides as to
21	whether he was guilty or not. Could your
22	experience possibly make you lean toward the
23	State's side because you, yourself, have an
24	experience similar to what the State would have
25	had?

1.	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I don't think
2	so.
3	MR. HARTLEY: You say you don't
4	think so. What if you got in there and it did have
5	an effect? We've got to know before you go to the
.6	jury room.
. 7	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I think I could
8 .	be fair.
9	MR. HARTLEY: But if you say you
10	think you could, that means there's some
11	possibility that you might not be fair.
12	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: No. I would be
13	fair.
14	MR. HARTLEY: You're absolutely
15	certain?
16	PROSPECTIVE JUROR: Uh-huh.
17	MR. HARTLEY: We want to be sure we
18	get the clearest answer we can, and I thank you.
19	THE COURT: If you would go back to
20	the jury assembly room.
21	(Out of the presence of Ms. Ortega.)
22	THE COURT: Okay. Mr. Hartley, do
23	you have some motions?
24	MR. HARTLEY: Judge, I would make a
25	motion to excuse for cause Juror No. 255, that

1.	lady, Ms. Catherine Ortega, and also Ms. Lee
2	Peters, I believe, was the other one. I think
3	you've already ruled on that, though.
4	THE COURT: Well, they both said, as
5	well as Ms. Lee, that whatever had happened to
6	them or Ms. Lee, her sister, would have no
7	impact, and that they could make a fair decision.
8	And I'm not going don't think that's challenge
9	for cause, and I'm going to deny your motion.
10	How many strikes?
11	THE CLERK: We have an odd number.
12	THE COURT: I'll this number from
13	the bottom.
14	THE CLERK: Okay.
15	THE COURT: No. 5. It looks like
16	that's Donald Porter.
17	THE CLERK: Okay. It would be nine
18	strikes apiece.
19	THE COURT: And I think we need an
20	alternate.
21	MR. BAILEY: I would ask for one.
22	THE COURT: How long is this case
23	going to take? Y'all had all those witnesses.
24	MR. BAILEY: I would anticipate
25	it I know taking today.

```
1
                      THE COURT: Okay. We'll just get
       one alternate. I think we'll be okay. I'll give
 2.
       y'all a moment.
 3
                      MR. HARTLEY: You said nine strikes
 4
       apiece?
 5
                      THE CLERK: Nine apiece.
 6
 7
                      (Brief recess.)
                     THE COURT: I'll certainly let him
 8
 9
       do that, but he needs to know he's got to follow
10
       the same procedures and rules as everyone else. Go
       ahead. Who is your first strike?
11
12
                      (Started striking jurors.)
13
                      THE COURT: You know, he accepted
14
       you as appointed counsel, and I don't -- if you
       aren't going to participate in the trial, then I
15
16
       need to know.
17
                      MR. HARTLEY: Your Honor, I was
18
       expecting -- I'm not trying to withdraw. I just
       think he has filed some handwritten motions asking
19
       to be allowed to act as his own counsel, but not --
20
21
                      THE COURT: Well, there's a
       difference in acting as his own counsel and having
22
       you still as his retained counsel. You can't have
23
       it both ways. If he wants to represent himself,
24
       then I need to treat that differently than if you
25
```

1	continue as appointed counsel. Let's get through
2	with the striking, and then I'll address it.
3	MR. HARTLEY: Thank you, Judge.
4	(Finish striking the jurors.)
5	THE CLERK: I'll read the remaining
6	numbers. 197, 200, 206, 207, 211, 215, 217, 221,
7	227, 233, 265, 267, and 268.
8	MR. BAILEY: Which one was the
9	alternate?
10	THE CLERK: 217.
11	MR. HARTLEY: I thought 287 was the
12	alternate.
13	THE COURT: 217.
14	THE CLERK: 217 was the last struck.
15	THE COURT: I've looked through this
16	file, and I don't see him filing anything about
17	representing himself.
18	THE DEFENDANT: I filed it
19	THE COURT: When did you file it?
20	THE DEFENDANT: It was back in June.
21	THE COURT: The only motion I see is
22	a writ of mandamus. But it does not appear to ask
23	that you represent yourself in a trial and that you
24	want to waive your attorney.
25	THE DEFENDANT: Well, I had filed

that in with the circuit clerk. 1 THE COURT: Well, they don't have 2 it, and they have everything in here that's been 3 filed to date. 4 5 Go ahead and get the jury, and then we'll take that up. 6 7 (In the presence of the jury.) THE COURT: If you'll go to one of 8 the end of the rows and remain standing, she's 9 going to swear you in. 10 11 THE CLERK: Would you raise your 12 right hand, please? 13 (Jurors sworn.) THE COURT: Okay. You can be 14 seated. Before we start the trial, I'm going to 15 briefly explain to you the procedures and the 16 17 duties of the Court and the duties of the jury. 18 First of all, as trial judge, it's my duty to instruct the orderly conduct of the trial, to rule 19 20 on questions of law as they may arise from time to 21 time, and at the end of the case, instruct you on 22 the law that applies. 23 Now, you, as the jury, you're the sole and 24 exclusive judges of the evidence. It's your duty 25 to listen to the evidence and from it determine the

3 ·

true facts, and then apply the law of the case as given to you by the Court to the facts as you find them to arrive at your verdict.

Now, the procedure that we'll be following is, first of all, counsel for the State will make an opening statement, and then defense will respond.

Each side, at this time, is confined to a statement of what they expect the evidence to show. Now, these statements, they are not evidence. They're simply given to familiarize you with the case.

Following opening statements, then evidence will be presented by witnesses and there may also be some exhibits. During the course of the trial, there will be objections. That's what the attorneys or the parties are supposed to do. And it's up to the Court to rule on those objections. But you should not concern yourself with any of the reasons for my rulings, as they're controlled and required by law. You're also not to speculate as to any possible answers to questions which are not required to be answered. In addition, the overruling of any objection is not intended to indicate the weight to be given such evidence.

Following the close of the evidence, then the attorneys will address you again and make closing

arguments. And at that time, they will discuss the evidence that's been presented and all reasonable inferences to help guide you to your verdict.

Now, we'll be taking breaks during the course of the trial. And it may depend on where we are with a particular witness, but if you do need to take a break, if you'll raise your hand, I'll try to be watching and we can do so.

I think I've introduced you to everyone involved in the trial except Meridith Newman, as our court reporter. She's taking everything down. And you've already met Ms. Cook. And we also have Deputy Harris with us.

I want to caution you at this time not to discuss the case with anyone. That includes a fellow juror. In fact, you're not even to consider the matter until you've heard all of the evidence. You're also not to make any investigations on your own, such as go to a scene or consult any legal periodicals.

Finally, if the Court, parties, witnesses, the attorneys, if we don't talk to you during the course of the trial, don't think we're being unfriendly. But it would just be improper to have any contact with you until this matter is

concluded.

1.

And I apologize for my voice. It sort of goes and comes. As I said, it's just this time of the year. We're going to take an early break today because there are a number of things we need to take up outside the presence of the jury. And hopefully, when you come back, we'll be able to start promptly and go more quickly. But I'm going to give you a long break until one o'clock. And at that time, if you'll report to the jury assembly room, we'll get you at one o'clock. Thank you.

(Out of the presence of the jury.)

THE COURT: Now, Mr. Minnifield, I need to know whether you're requesting at this time to represent yourself or do you want your court-appointed attorney?

 $\begin{tabular}{ll} \begin{tabular}{ll} \be$ 

THE COURT: Mr. Minnifield, before I let you do that, I need to ask you a number of things.

And has he discussed this possibility with you, Mr. Hartley? I know you've been involved with this case for some time. And, for the record -- and I think you've been very instrumental and

helpful in looking at alternatives and over the course of it, different ways of resolving this matter, including this morning. But, evidently, he has mentioned to you that he wanted to represent himself?

MR. HARTLEY: Yes, Your Honor. In the course of my contact with Mr. Minnifield over a long period of time, I do recollect that he indicated that he wanted to do some parts of the questioning of witnesses and to present --

THE COURT: Well, he can't just do some parts, you know. You can't pick and choose which questions you're going to ask a witness.

Even if you have two attorneys, only one gets a witness.

MR. HARTLEY: Oh, I meant that,
Judge. He understood that he would have to carry
any particular witness all the way through, and
there would be no ability for us to swap back and
forth like that. I think that he wants to conduct
the examination possibly of the State's principal
witness, Ms. Vonciel Minnifield.

THE COURT: Well, let me hear from you, Mr. Minnifield. Do you want to represent yourself in this case?

THE DEFENDANT: I do prefer to 1 2 represent myself entirely, and I'm qualified. THE COURT: Well, I'm going to ask 3 you some questions. And, first of all, do you 4. understand that you're charged with stalking and 5 what the elements of that offense are? 6 THE DEFENDANT: Sure. THE COURT: Now, you have a right to represent yourself, but you also have a right to 9 have an attorney. And I have previously appointed 10 . 11 Mr. Hartley, and he's been very involved in the 12 case and as an attorney. And the Court has had the 13 opportunity to have Mr. Hartley in the court for a 14 number of years, and I know that he has skills and 15. experiences that you do not. Why do you want to 16 represent yourself? 17 PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I want to 18 represent myself due to the fact that in the past, 19 there have been some dealing and understanding that 20 I didn't go along with between Mr. Hartley and the 21 State. 22 THE COURT: Give me an example. 23 THE DEFENDANT: For instance, like, I got locked up November '98, and my bail was set 24 at hundred thousand dollars. I go for a bail 25

hearing and Judge Bright set my bail -- reduced my 1 bail of forty thousand dollars. 2 3 THE COURT: Well, that was before Judge Bright and would have been involved before 4 Mr. Hartley got in the case. And I do --5 6 THE DEFENDANT: That was right. 7 THE COURT: -- know that you made an oral notice to reduce the bond. And there does 8 9 seem to -- there has been one motion filed, but 1.0 that was in December by -- that's not in the file. by Mr. Minnifield, and I'll look it over in just a 11 12 moment. THE DEFENDANT: It was December '98 <u>1</u>3 14 when the bail was reduced to forty thousand 15 dollars, but --16 THE COURT: Mr. Minnifield, what 17 occurred before Judge Bright does not concern Mr. Hartley or this Court. Were you involved --18 19 MR. HARTLEY: Yes. 20 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, he was. 21 THE COURT: You were? 22 MR. HARTLEY: Yes, Judge. I don't have a real complete recall, but I was involved 23 because -- I forget why we had to have Judge 24 25 Bright's involvement in it. But it seemed to me

```
that she did agree to a reduction of forty
 7
       thousand. And there was some delay, Judge, in
 2
       getting, I think, it possibly recorded in the jail.
 3
       There may have been something, and I think
 4
 5
       Mr. Minnifield was disturbed about that.
 6
                      THE COURT: Now, Mr. Minnifield,
       what is your age?
 7
                      THE DEFENDANT: Sixty.
 8
                      THE COURT: And could you briefly
 9
10
       give -- set out your work experience?
                      THE DEFENDANT: Yes. My work
11
12
       experience was the last job I had was contractor,
       construction, heavy equipment operator, and
13
       etcetera.
14
                      THE COURT: And what other types of
15
16
       work have you done?
                      PROSPECTIVE JUROR: I have been a
17
18
       currier, and I've been chief maintenance man at
       Wilson and Price. I've been a truck driver.
19
20
                      THE COURT: Have you ever been
       treated for any mental disease or mental health?
21
                      THE DEFENDANT: No, I haven't. I
22
       went and -- when --
23
                      THE COURT: And the Court is aware
24
25
       that I did -- when you were out on bond, the EVEN
```

1	program, but other than that?
2	THE DEFENDANT: I did go to mental
3	health just to see was I what everybody what
4	peoples think.
5	THE COURT: And when was that?
6	THE DEFENDANT: That was in
7	August September, I believe it was.
8	THE COURT: And that's while you
9	were out on bond?
10	THE DEFENDANT: That's while I was
11	out on bond. And I voluntarily went there.
12	THE COURT: And did you undergo any
13	course of treatment?
14	THE DEFENDANT: I had one session
15	that they gave me a counselor. Then they let me
16	seen a doctor, and I had a thirty-day waiting
17	period before I could go back. But before I could
18	go back, I was locked up two days before I went
19	back.
20	THE COURT: Did they make any
21	diagnosis?
22	THE DEFENDANT: Well, they were
23	going to diagnosis and put me on medication when I
24	went back.
25	THE COURT: Do you know what type

1 did they discuss any -- are you on any medications 2 now? THE DEFENDANT: No, I'm not. 3 THE COURT: What about any prior felony convictions -- do you have any prior felony 5 convictions? 6 7 THE DEFENDANT: I have prior convictions goes back during the mid and late '70s. 8 THE COURT: Well, you need to be 9 aware even if they're old cases that they may be 10 11 used for the purposes of the habitual offender act, and if you are found quilty, there would be an 12 enhance penalty. Therefore, the consequences of 1.3 conviction, if there is one here, is much greater 14 than as if this had been your first offense. 15 16 THE DEFENDANT: I understand. 17 THE COURT: And I think this is a Class C felony, so if there have been -- how many 18 19 prior felony convictions? MR. BAILEY: He has tons. 20 THE COURT: Well, let's just say if 21 you have three or more felony convictions, and if 22 you are found guilty, the minimum sentence is 23 fifteen years and it can go up to life or 24 ninety-nine. Do you understand that? 25

1	THE DEFENDANT: I understand that.
2	THE COURT: Now, you understand that
3	you would be required to comply with all the rules
4	of procedure and rules of evidence?
5	THE DEFENDANT: Right.
6	THE COURT: And you do have a right
7	to cross-examine the State's witnesses. But if you
8	cross-examine them, you cannot testify at that
9	time.
10	THE DEFENDANT: Right.
11	THE COURT: You have the right to
12	have witnesses also appear on your behalf. Do you
13	understand that?
14	THE DEFENDANT: Right.
15	THE COURT: Now, you have the right
16	to testify, if you choose to. But you also have
17	the right to remain silent; that is, not testify.
18	And that cannot be considered against you. Do you
19	understand that?
20	THE DEFENDANT: I understand.
21	THE COURT: But if you do choose to
22	testify, then the State has a right to
23	cross-examine you and may also ask you about prior
24	convictions.
25	THE DEFENDANT: Right.

THE COURT: And do you still want to 1 represent yourself? 2 THE DEFENDANT: Sure. 3 THE COURT: Mr. Hartley, I'm going 4 to still have you available during the trial, and 5 you can sit there at counsel table. б Mr. Hartley may offer suggestions during the 7 course of the trial. 8 And, Mr. Hartley, you might -- at the 9 appropriate time, if you make any suggestions and 10 Mr. Minnifield does not take your advice, at some 11 point you may want to put that on the record. 12 So I'm going to ask you again. Do you still 13 want to represent yourself? 14 THE DEFENDANT: Sure. 15 MR. HARTLEY: Your Honor, may I put 16 this on the record? 17 THE COURT: Yes. 18 MR. HARTLEY: I certainly want to be 19 as much of assistance as I can. I'm not in the 20 business of abandoning my clients. I sure like to 21 be right here and help him as much as I can 2.2 throughout the trial and throughout breaks. I have 23 had access to the file, and he's had access to the 24 file also for considerable periods of time. 25

help him with documents, I want to be as much assistance as I can possibly be.

THE COURT: Well, at this time, I'm going to find Mr. Minnifield -- let me say one other thing, Mr. Minnifield. I am aware that some time ago you had a city appeal where you represented yourself; is that correct?

THE DEFENDANT: Sure.

THE COURT: And I do recall that it was a verdict in your favor. But this is a much more serious matter, and I'm not sure that the City attorney was as prepared as Mr. Bailey would be and certainly nothing came up about any prior convictions during the course of that. And I think some of the witnesses that might have wanted to be called by the City, your family, did not want to testify. You have a different situation here, so don't think just because you did it once, you understand that it may not be the same result?

explain to the jury that you're representing yourself and that you do have the right to do so, and that Mr. Hartley will be sitting at counsel table and be available for any advice or

THE DEFENDANT: I understand.

suggestions you may want to ask. 1. And, as you know, it's the Court's duty to ensure the orderly conduct of the trial. And I don't expect any problem, but if something does 4 develop, I will certainly have to take that up at 5 the appropriate time. So I guess we'll recess 6 unless there's anything else anyone wants to say? 7 If we could have him back here by a quarter 8 9 till one. Do we need to call the jail? In case there's anything else we need to put on the record? 10 11 THE BAILIFF: I'll just tell them to 12 keep him on the first floor. THE COURT: And if there's anything 13 14 else we need to bring up, we can. 15 Mr. Bailey, is there anything you want to put 16 on the record? 17 MR. BAILEY: I don't believe so, Your Honor. 18 (Out of the presence of the 19 defendant.) 20 21 (Witnesses line up in front of the 22 Judge.) 23 THE COURT: I know that all of you

had rather be somewhere other than here, but you're

required to be here. You've been subpoenaed. And

24

25

```
we're slower getting started than we normally are.
 7
       And you are under subpoena, and everyone needs to
 2
      be back here at one o'clock. Do you understand
 3
       that?
                      THE WITNESS: I've got a question.
       I've got -- my husband is -- I'm here by myself.
       I've got three kids.
                      THE COURT: Wait just a minute.
 8
       What's your name?
 9
                      THE WITNESS: I'm Clemmitha. I'm a
10.
       witness. And my child -- I've got a child in
11
       school. My sister has to be at work, and I have
12
       nobody else to babysit.
1.3
                      THE COURT: Well, maybe you could
14
       take her first.
15
                      MR. BAILEY: Okay. Clemmitha.
16
                      MR. HARTLEY: Who were you?
17
                     THE WITNESS: Clemmitha,
18
       C-1-e-m-m-i-t-h-a.
19
                      MR. HARTLEY: Can the other
20
       witnesses just identify themselves just so I'll
21
       know who they are?
22
                      THE WITNESS: I'm Rosebud Brown.
23
                      THE WITNESS: Pete Rose. Also, I'm
24
       a store manager. I have to get to my store, if I
25
```

could go second or something? 1 THE COURT: You've got an hour and a 2 half, and we'll try to accommodate everyone. 3 THE WITNESS: Lawanda Benson. (Witnesses excused.) 5 (In the presence of the jury.) 6 THE COURT: In just a moment, you'll hear opening statements. After the break this 8 morning, Mr. Minnifield advised the Court that he 9 wanted to represent himself. I appointed 10 Mr. Hartley to represent him, but Mr. Minnifield 11 has the right to represent himself and waive an 1.2 attorney, and he has done so. So he will be 13 representing himself. But I have asked Mr. Hartley 14 to remain in in the event Mr. Minnifield needs to 15 consult with him or that Mr. Hartley may have some 16 suggestions. 17 Mr. Bailey, are you ready at this time? 18 MR. BAILEY: Yes, Your Honor. 19 it please the Court, counsel? 20 Control. Ladies and gentlemen, that's why 21 we're here today. That's why you're sitting here 22 today is because of control, because of a man's 23 desire to get control and undue desire to get 24 control. And what happened when he failed to do

25

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

so? That's what this case is all about. That's what generally stalking is all about. And I expect that during the course of this trial, you're going to hear about the control that this man perpetrated on this woman.

Vonciel Minnifield is here today, and she's going to tell you about the events that happened over a pretty long course of time, which makes up the elements of the stalking case that's brought to you today. She's going to tell you that her and Mr. Minnifield were married about approximately October of 1994, and they stayed married, and are still currently married. She's filed for a divorce -- but they stayed together for approximately a little over three years, almost four years. And she's going to tell you about that when they first met, everything was lovely, as it is in most normal relationships. She had no idea that the man that she was about to marry, would marry, was going to turn out the way he did. clue.

She'll tell you that everything rocked along pretty good in their marriage, and then little by little, they started having problems. She started noticing his want to control her, to know where she

1.

was at all times. She'll tell you that he began to become verbally abusive to her, to intimidate her. She'll tell you what happened one day when her and her kids had gone somewhere. It was a stormy day -- stormy night --

THE COURT: Mr. Bailey, wait just a minute. Are you a witness in this matter?

MR. BAILEY: She's with our office,

Judge.

THE COURT: Okay.

MR. BAILEY: -- stormy night, and she and the kids came home to their marital home and found that all the doors in the house, the locks had been changed. They had nowhere to go. They couldn't get him to let them in, so her and the kids decided to go find another place to live.

And it was at that time that Vonciel decided that their marriage couldn't be saved, that she wasn't going to stay in the marriage that she was in. And she decided finally to do something about it, Vonciel thinking that finally maybe this is the break that she needed to get her life back on track, to get away from all this control and all this intimidation and all this harassment. But little did she know that was only the beginning,

only the beginning of her nightmare.

1.3

2.2

Now, during the course of my career of prosecutor, I don't find very much the victims are ever really happy to come into court, really feel good about coming into court. But I know I can say this about Vonciel -- and I'm not saying that she enjoys this process -- but for the Grace of God, ladies and gentlemen, I would be standing up before you right now, and this table would be empty and I would be telling you about murder in the first degree, but for the Grace of God.

Ladies and gentlemen, what happened after

Vonciel and her children left the marital home?

The defendant began to call her on the telephone.

THE DEFENDANT: Object.

THE COURT: I'm going to overrule your objection if this is what --

MR. BAILEY: The evidence will show --

THE COURT: -- you expect the evidence to show.

MR. BAILEY: The evidence will show in this case that the defendant began to call her on the telephone, harassing, threatening her life. The defendant would show up her at workplace --

1 THE DEFENDANT: I'm objecting on that. 2 THE COURT: I'm overruling. 3 a right to tell the jury what he expects the 4 evidence to show. And you will be able to tell the 5 jury what you expect the evidence to show. 6 Go ahead. 7 MR. BAILEY: The defendant would 8 show up at her workplace telling her co-workers 9 quite frankly that she better watch out, that he 10 11 was going to get her. 12 He would show up at her babysitter's house. He even showed up at one of her babysitter's house 13 with a gun. We expect Lawanda Benson to come in --14 THE DEFENDANT: Object. 15 16 MR. BAILEY: -- and testify --THE DEFENDANT: 17 Object. THE COURT: Mr. Minnifield, he has a 18 right to tell the jury what he expects the evidence 19 to show. 20 Go ahead. 21 2.2 MR. BAILEY: I expect Lawanda Benson to come in and tell you what happened one night. 23 24 Mr. Minnifield showed up wanting to know where Vonciel was. He told Lawanda Benson what he was 25

going to do to Vonciel, and you can hear that for yourself when she testifies. He showed her a gun. He's come to her church on multiple times harassing her, trying to find her, threatening her. He's contacted her friends and her family on numerous occasions.

We also expect the evidence to show that during the course of these events that were being perpetrated upon Vonciel, she filed several charges against Mr. Minnifield down at the municipal court -- charges such as harassment, reckless endangerment for running her off the road at one time.

And we expect the evidence to show, and Ms. Minnifield will tell you, that the defendant was found guilty down at the city court on those charges. The stalking case that's brought to you today is done through a course of conduct.

Stalking is a law which encompasses a course of conduct. It's not just one incident as you would have in any other case, such as a robbery, or shoplifting, or a murder. Stalking consists of a whole course of conduct. And that's what you're going to hear today. You're going to hear a whole course of conduct that was perpetrated upon Mrs.

Minnifield.

charged with. Some of it was uncharged.

Mrs. Minnifield will tell you at the beginning that she was scared to file charges on him and didn't on most of the things that he had done, but then it got to the point where she had to do something.

Some of this conduct, the defendant has been

So some of the events that you will hear of, he's been charged with and some of the events he's been uncharged with. But they all go together into the course of conduct that you will see.

This case today is brought to us by the course of an indictment -- by the way of an indictment.

The Judge will tell you at the end of the case that the indictment is not to be considered by you as evidence in this case when weighing the defendant's guilt or innocence. It's simply a vehicle by which the case is brought to you today, to let you know, let the defendant know, what he is charged with.

At this time, I want to read the indictment that was brought forward by the Montgomery County grand jury in this case. It reads, "The State of Alabama, Montgomery County, Circuit Court of Montgomery County, February term A.D., 1999. The grand jury of said county charged that before the

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

finding of this indictment, John Willie Minnifield, alias, John Willie Minnifailed; alias, Willie Minnifield; alias, John W. Minnifailed; alias, John W. Minnifelt; alias, J. W. Minnifailed; alias, John Minnifield; alias, John Willie Minnifiled; alias Willie John Minnifelt, whose name is otherwise unknown to the grand jury, John Willie Minnifield, alias did intentionally and repeatedly follow or harass Vonciel Minnifield and made a credible threat, either expressed or implied, with the intent to place that person in reasonable fear of death or serious bodily harm in violation of Section 13A, 690 of the Code of Alabama against the peace and the dignity of the State of Alabama. that is signed by Eleanor I. Brooks, District Attorney, for the 15th Judicial Circuit of Alabama." Ladies and gentlemen, I expect that the State

will prove to you exactly what is contained within this indictment through the testimony, through exhibits, during the course of this trial. Something that I did read in the indictment that I want you to consider throughout the course of this trial -- and those were some of the last words that I read -- against the peace and the dignity of the

10.

State of Alabama. Keep that in your mind, and I will address that at a later time.

But ladies and gentlemen, the evidence in this case is going to show that Mr. Minnifield perpetrated a course of conduct which the State of Alabama has labeled stalking on Mrs. Minnifield. And once you have been able to hear all the evidence, see all the evidence that's introduced, based on the evidence, I feel that you will find the defendant, Mr. Minnifield, guilty of the crime stalking. Thank you.

THE COURT: Mr. Minnifield, if you want to, at this time, you can tell the jury what you expect the evidence to show.

THE DEFENDANT: Thank you.

My name is John Minnifield. I wish to explain to you all -- and I'm going to show you the evidence -- that this is not a stalking charge. My wife and I, we did have some disagreement. And that disagreement, I'm going to bring up to show you why this occurred. I'm going to show you my wife was cheating. I'm going to show you that my wife was on drugs, and she's still on drugs. I've got in evidence, I'm going to show you several men that she gave diseases to --

MR. BAILEY: Judge, I object.

THE DEFENDANT: -- including me.

THE COURT: Wait just a moment,

Mr. Minnifield. I'm sustaining the objection and disregard the comment about other men. That is not admissible evidence. Go ahead.

witnesses that I have here today will tell you that John Minnifield was a loving husband who worked four and five jobs to satisfy his family, that at no time John Minnifield ever put his hand on Vonciel Minnifield. He have never. And any kind of threat, nothing but a loving way. I will pass on down to you, I came from a violent family. I've seen abusive. This was never to happen to me and my family.

I never locked her out of the house. I'm going to show you that Vonciel, every day, she was just running, running, running. Come in at twelve and one o'clock at night. I worked too hard. I couldn't stand it. My wife left me. I went and searched for her to bring her back. She did come back, but she couldn't keep -- let the street go. She was constant running out there just every night. There was a 13-year-old and a 14-year-old

1.4

girl in school. And that, I implied, that they get an education. They cannot get an education staying out twelve and one o'clock at night and coming in with her. I get up in the morning. I go to work four and five o'clock in the morning. She's late for work every day, if she go to work. I want you all to see this pattern. All this evidence is going to unfold here.

As far as a weapon concern, John Minnifield has had his hand on a gun in thirty years or better. I have no violent past, and I'm not about to start now. I'm sixty years of age. I loved my family, and I felt though this was the last of the row, but I could not stand drugs and what she was doing no more than she could stand the alcohol that I drank. But she drank. But it's not all right for me to drank. But I didn't have a habit of -- a drug habit, a lying habit. I didn't come in lying to my family. I didn't cheat on my family, and I didn't abuse my family.

I'm going to show you all of that as the witness come through here. And if you all find John Minnifield guilty, I want you to look at your spouses when you go home --

MR. BAILEY: Judge, I object to

1 that. THE COURT: I'm sustaining the objection. Mr. Minnifield, just what you expect 3 the evidence to show. Anything else? 4 5 THE DEFENDANT: I'm going to show you this. I just want y'all to sit back and listen 6 7 to the evidence as it unfolds. And there's no way you could find John Minnifield guilty of stalking. 8 Thank vou. 9 10 THE COURT: Okay. Your first 11 witness? 12 MR. BAILEY: Your Honor, the State 13 would call Clemmitha Petace. 14 CLEMMITHA PETACE 15 The witness, having first been duly sworn or affirmed to speak the truth, the whole truth, and 16 17 nothing but the truth, testified as follows: 18 DIRECT EXAMINATION 19 BY MR. BAILEY: 20 Good afternoon, ma'am. Could you please tell the ladies and gentlemen of the jury your 21 22 name? . Clemmitha Petace, C-l-e-m-m-i-t-h-a, 23 P-e-t-a-c-e. 24 Q. And, Ms. Petace, do you know Vonciel 25

1	Minnifield and John Minnifield?
2	A. Yes, I do.
3	Q. Okay. And how do you know them?
4	A. Vonciel is my sister, and John is her
5	husband.
6	Q. Now, Ms. Petace, I want to get right to
7	the point and direct your attention to the case at
8	hand actually, I want to back up for just a
9	second and direct your attention back to October of
10	1998. During that time frame, did you witness
11	anything that occurred with Mr. Minnifield that you
12	would find unusual?
13 .	A. Yes. I had he had at the time
14	after the incident where I had to bring you
15	know, lead y'all into what had happened
16	Q. Well, just tell me what you know and what
17	you observed and what you heard and saw.
18	A., Okay. What I heard and saw. Okay.
19	THE COURT: Now
20	Q. From the defendant. I'm sorry.
21	A. After the incident that happened when he
22	came to her house with an ax and knocked down the
23	door. He had come to my house
24	THE DEFENDANT: Object.

Did you have --

25

THE DEFENDANT: Object. 1 THE COURT: Overruled. 2 Did you have an opportunity to see the 3. ο. defendant? 4 Yes, I did. Α. 5 Okav. Tell us what happened when --6 Well, I was leaving out that morning, and 7 I got in my car. I was headed to Superlube to get 8 my oil change. And he was coming in and I was 9 going out. I stay in an apartment complex. And he 10 was waving me down. I told him I had to hurry up 11 and get an oil change. So he followed me to 12 Superlube, and he told -- basically told me that he 13 did -- just got out of jail. And he told me, I 14 just went to your sister's house last night, and I 15 had knocked the door. And I chased her around the 16 house with an ax. And he said, I hit your niece, 17 and I'm sorry about that. I didn't mean to do 1.8 that, but -- and then he's like, well -- he got a 19 20 little beep on his pager --THE COURT: Let's get a little more 21 question and answer. 22 Okay. Is that all that he told you? 23 Ο.

No. He was -- I couldn't really

understand him because he was drunk at the time.

24

He was intoxicated. You could smell the alcohol on his breath, and so I really couldn't understand everything he was saying. But he did -- you know, I did understand about the ax, and he said he did have it in the trunk of his car right now. And he had got a pager -- a page, and he had went to use the phone. And I was still at Superlube. By the time he made it back, I had already left.

- Q. Okay. Now, let me back up because I'm not sure -- if you would, slow down so everybody can understand you. You said, I believe, he had something in his trunk? He told you that?
  - A. He had an ax in his trunk.
  - Q. Ax?

1.5

- A. He said, I have it right now. He basically told me what happened. And I couldn't -- he did tell me more, but I couldn't really understand, so I can't question on that. But he did say that he had, and he did broke in her house and chase and strike one of her daughters in the face, so I can testify --
  - Q. And that was in October of '98?
  - A. 198.

MR. BAILEY: Thank you. No further questions from this witness.

THE COURT: Do you want to ask her 1 anything? 2. THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 3 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY THE DEFENDANT: 5 Clemmitha, I did come to your house and 6 talk to you. I never told --7. MR. BAILEY: Judge, I'm going to 8 object to him testifying. 9 THE COURT: You can ask her 10 questions. You cannot testify. Just ask her 11 12 questions. THE DEFENDANT: Okay. 13 Q. I did come to your house, and I did ask 14 you question, had you seen my wife. I didn't go --15 THE COURT: Wait just a moment. 16 What is your question? Did she -- he asked you if 17 you had seen his wife? 18 THE DEFENDANT: My wife, right. 19 20 Q. I only asked her -- did I ask you not, did you see my wife? Have you seen my family? 21 I don't remember that. You had asked 22 me -- you had said a lot. Like I said, I couldn't 23 really understand what you were saying because you 24 were intoxicated at the time, so I really can't 25

1	speak on that Dut I know way did falles we to
	speak on that. But I know you did follow me to
2	Superlube.
3	Q. And did I follow you to Superlube?
4	A. Yeah. I know you remember that. You did
5	follow me to Superlube, and you sat down beside me.
6	And you was carrying on about how you were sorry,
7	but you did strike one of her daughters in the face
8	and you did break in her house that night, and you
. 9	had just got out of jail. You did tell me that, so
10	I can speak on that.
11	THE COURT: Okay. You've answered
12	it. Do you have another question?
13	THE DEFENDANT: No.
14	THE COURT: Do you have anything
15	else for her?
16	MR. BAILEY: That's all I have for
17	her.
18	THE COURT: You can step down, and
19	you are excused.
20	(Witness excused.)
21	THE COURT: Your next witness?
22	MR. BAILEY: Your Honor, this is
23	Pete Rose.
2 4	PETE ROSE
25	The witness, having first been duly sworn or

```
1
       affirmed to speak the truth, the whole truth, and
       nothing but the truth, testified as follows:
 2
 3
                       DIRECT EXAMINATION
 4
       BY MR. BAILEY:
 5
                 Would you please tell the ladies and
       gentlemen of the jury your name?
 6
 7
           Α
                 Pete Rose.
            Q. If you could --
 8
 9
                      MR. BAILEY: If I may approach to
10
       adjust his microphone for him?
11
                 If you could, speak into that so
12
       everybody can hear you. It's kind of hard to hear
13
       sometimes. What was your name again, sir?
14
            Α.
                Pete Rose.
15
                 And how are you employed, sir?
16
            Α.
                 I'm a store manager at Autozone.
17
                Okay. And that's here in Montgomery?
            Q.
18
            A. Yes, sir.
19
                 Get right to the point. Do you know a
            Q.
20
       person by the name of Vonciel Minnifield?
21
                 Yes, sir.
            Α.
22
                 How do you know her?
23
                 I came in contact with Mrs. Minnifield.
24
       She came in the store and inquired on a part one
25
       afternoon. I just remember the whole thing, but we
```

talked and talked and talked and we finally became 1 friends, and it was just a friendship that we had. 2 3 Ο. Okay. Basically, that's how we met. She came 4 Α. in and inquired on a part. 5 Okay. I'm sorry. I'm not understanding 6 what you're saying. She came in to do what? 7 Inquire on a part. 8 Okay. Inquiring on a part. Now, did --9 Q. during the course of the time that you knew 10 Mrs. Minnifield, did you have an opportunity to 11 know a person by the name of John Minnifield? 12 Yes, sir. Α. 13 Okay. And can you tell us any dealings 14 that you have had with him, any incidents where you 1.5 had come into contact with him -- let me ask you 16 this. How many times did you come in contact with 17 him? 18 Α. Once. 19 Can you tell the ladies and gentlemen of 2.0 Q. the jury about that one time that you did come into 21 contact with him? 22 Well, Mr. Minnifield entered the store, 23 and I didn't exactly know who he was. He came in

and asked me who I was, and I told him who I was,

24

and he explained to me that I knew him. I asked him -- we walked back in the back, and he explained to me that he was Mrs. Minnifield's husband. And in so many other ways he told me to leave her alone. They were going through some problems, and he told me to leave her alone. I just told him we didn't have any -- there wasn't any dealings with me and her. She came in and asked for a part, and that was it. And he just told me to leave her alone. Don't fool with her. Just leave her alone. And he said some more things that I don't think I should say in court.

Q. Now, if you don't mind. I understand -- the jury understands --

THE COURT: Can you set a time frame?

- Q. Yeah. What time frame is this we're talking about approximately? I don't mean the exact date, but can you tell us approximately --
  - A. Within weeks.
- Q. Okay. But I'm talking about time frame. What year?
- A. Couple years ago -- a year ago, something like this.
  - Q. Would this be '98?

A. Yes.

- Q. Okay. Time frame when in 1998?
- A. That's going to be hard.
  - Q. Spring, summer, winter?
  - A. Spring, because it was hot.
- Q. Now, I was going to ask you about some statements that you said Mr. Minnifield had made to you that you didn't feel that you could repeat --
  - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. -- but the jury understands that you're just repeating things he said. Now, if you could please tell us exactly what he said.
- A. Well, he came in and he told me that

  Mrs. Minnifield was a carrier of a venereal disease

  and if I was dealing with her, just leave her alone

  because she gave him this particular venereal

  disease, and she's a carrier. And I'm telling him,

  Why are you telling me this? This is your wife. I

  don't have no problem with that. But he went on to

  tell me that she's a carrier of this disease, and

  she gave him the disease and, you know, it would be

  to my best interest to leave her alone. And she's

  trouble. She's trouble, trouble. I think I made

  my own judgment because Mrs. Minnifield came in

  just like a regular customer, like all my other

Customers do, and there wasn't anything going on.

But he came in and basically, boastfully, told me
to leave her alone because she's a carrier. And I
think he had -- I knew he had a lot of anger. He
went on to try to tell me some more personal
things, and I told him point-blank, that's not my
business. I don't want to hear about it. He tried
to boastfully tell me, and I just told him I didn't
want to hear about it.

- Q. Did anything else transpire?
- A. No.
- Q. Okay. Did he then leave the business?
- A. Yes.

1.7

- Q. Do you have any idea how he came into contact with you -- any personal knowledge?
- A. I think the mechanic that Mrs. Minnifield brought in the store --
- THE COURT: Now, you can't go into what somebody else might have known or told you.
- Q. I guess what I'm asking you, Mr. Rose, did he advise you when he first starting talking to you or any time during the conversation as to how he got your name or how he wound up at your location?
  - A. Like I said, the mechanic that

1	Mrs. Minnifield brought in, I think. The mechanic
2	and Mr. Minnifield either was working partners
3	or
4	THE DEFENDANT: Objection on that.
5	THE COURT: I'm going to sustain as
6	to what they if he didn't say anything just
7	MR. BAILEY: That's fine.
8	A. For Mr. Minnifield to know my name, I
9	wear it like it's on here now.
10	Q. Had you ever seen Mr. Minnifield with
11	anybody else with that business associated with
12	that business your business, I guess?
13	A. No.
14	MR. BAILEY: I don't think I have
15	any other questions of Mr. Rose.
16	CROSS-EXAMINATION
17	BY THE DEFENDANT:
18	Q. Mr. Rose, I want you to think hard. I
19	want you to think back the first time you seen me.
20	THE COURT: Okay. What's your
21	question?
22	Q. The question is: Whom asked who do they
23	know each other? I know you. I know you. Can you
24	remember those words?
25	A. No, sir.

1	Q. I know you. I know you.
2	A. I wouldn't have a reason to ask you, I
3	know, I know you, Mr. Minnifield.
4	Q. You wouldn't have a reason to ask?
5	A. No, sir.
6	Q. But you heard my voice. I have a
7	distinct voice that once a person hear my voice,
8	they never forgot that voice.
9	THE COURT: Now, what is your
10	question, Mr. Minnifield?
11	THE DEFENDANT: I'm fixing to ask it
12	now.
13	Q. Okay. That's what shook your conscious?
14	A. What do you mean shook by conscious?
15	Q. That voice
16	THE COURT: Are you asking him if he
17	recognized
18	THE DEFENDANT: I'm asking him
19	THE COURT: your voice from some
20	other occasion?
21	THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
22	THE COURT: Did you recognize his
23	THE WITNESS: I didn't know him then
24	until when he came in. His voice, his looks, or
25	nothing is not distinct to me.

And I came in boastfully, is that what 1 Q. you're saying? 2 Yes, you did. 3 You didn't tell me nothing about my wife 4 car that was sitting out there in front of your 5 6 blazer? 7 No, I didn't tell you anything about 8 that. 9 Think now. Think now. Q. 10 Α. I don't have to think. I don't have to think. 11 12 And why it was there? 13 No, sir. Α. 14 Q. Okay. I'm going to get off right now, 15 but you're going to be called back up here. 16 THE COURT: No, sir. You need to ask him whatever you're going to ask now. 17 18 THE DEFENDANT: There's some more that's got to come in, and then I got to put --19 20 THE COURT: Mr. Minnifield, whatever 21 you want to ask him, ask him now because I'm going 22 to excuse him. 23 MR. HARTLEY: Your Honor, he is 24 under subpoena as defendant's witness. 25 THE COURT: Well, I have told this

witness that I would let him go. They're taking ٦ him out of order because he has to get back to 2 business. I'll take this up in a moment. Have you 3 got a phone number where you can be reached? 4 THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am. 5 6 THE COURT: I'm going to have him on call. You're still under subpoena. And if it's 7 not connected up, I'm not going to let him just --8 9 what else do you need --10 THE DEFENDANT: As long as he can be called back in because as some other testimony goes 11 1.2 around, then it's going to show where this man is 13 purgering himself. 14 THE COURT: Mr. Minnifield, that is 15 an inappropriate comment, and I'll ask that the 16 jury disregard it. You're excused at this time. 17 (Witness excused.) 18 THE COURT: I'm going to take a 19 short break. It may help the procedure. So we'll 20 take about a ten-minute break. 21 (Out of the presence of the jury.) 22 THE COURT: Mr. Minnifield, I want 23 you to make an offer of what you expect the 24 evidence to show that would require this witness to 25 be brought back in.

1.

2.

THE DEFENDANT: I'm going to show the evidence where Pete Rose and the night -- and I never denied this -- that I did kick her door in and the reason I kicked her door in was Pete Rose was the guy in the closet, and that's where he heard my voice from.

THE COURT: Well, I don't know why you couldn't have asked all of that right now.

THE DEFENDANT: He's sitting up there saying one thing, but --

THE COURT: I don't know why you couldn't ask him that at this time.

THE DEFENDANT: Right. Because I wanted to bring in this other person first, that go along with and tell the same thing, and he know that he was in that apartment. But he is purgering himself --

going to caution you right now not to characterize any witness's testimony in that way. I'm about to make a determination that you're not competent to represent yourself and require Mr. Hartley to do so. As I say, you've got to follow the same rules and procedure. And I expect when a witness is called for you to follow up and ask all the

1.5

2.1

questions that can be asked of that witness at that time.

One thing I did not put on the record that needs to be put on the record is that

Mr. Minnifield, I found at that time, had intelligently waived his right to have counsel. Of course, for the record, Mr. Minnifield, you realize that at any time you can change your mind and request Mr. Hartley to represent you in this case.

I don't think that you are helping your case by the way it's being tried, and I would ask -- I'm going to take a short break and, Mr. Hartley, maybe you can just discuss briefly with him about asking questions.

Mr. Minnifield, you cannot testify when you ask questions. You just need to ask the questions. And, again, I'm not going to let witnesses just be brought back and forth with something that can be taken up at the time they testify. And I don't know why that could not have been asked of that witness. Let's take about a ten-minute recess.

(Brief recess taken.)

THE COURT: Mr. Minnifield, let me put something on the record. In your opening statement, you made reference to your wife

allegedly having a sexually transmitted disease, and the Court sustained the State's objection to that. I did not see that it was relevant to this charge. But during the State's witness -- second witness, that testimony -- there was testimony regarding that, and you certainly would be able to argue that in closing. Okay.

Who is going to be -- you can be getting your next witness.

(In the presence of the jury.)

MR. BAILEY: Okay. Your next

witness?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

## VONCIEL MINNIFIELD

The witness, having first been duly sworn or affirmed to speak the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, testified as follows:

## DIRECT EXAMINATION

## BY MR. BAILEY:

- Q. Would you please tell the ladies and gentlemen of the jury your name?
  - A. Vonciel Minnifield
- Q. Mrs. Minnifield, let me get directly to the case at hand. Do you know the person by the name of John Minnifield?
  - A. Yes, I do.

. 1 Q. And how do you know him? 2 He's my husband. Α. 3 When -- I just want to kind of get a history of you and Mr. Minnifield. When did you 4 5 and Mr. Minnifield meet? A. We met in 1992. 6 7 And did y'all date for a while? Q. 8 Α. Yes, we did. . 9 Q. Okay. How long did you date? 10 Α. Two years. Two years. And, eventually, you got 11 Q. 12 married? 13 Α. Yes. 14 Q. And when did y'all get married? 15 A. October 8th of '94. 16 During the time that you dated Mr. Minnifield and subsequently married 17 Mr. Minnifield, did you ever have any serious 18 19 problems? 20 Α. Not at first, no. 21 Did you ever notice anything that would Q. 22 cause you alarm about Mr. Minnifield? 23 Α. Once about two years after we were 24 married, there was an argument. I can't recall what it was, and he shoved me, and, you know, more 25

```
or less, I told him that I didn't want him putting
 ٦
       his hands on me. But I didn't call the police or
 2
 3
       anything. And that kind of alarmed me.
            Q. So you were married in October '94,
 4
 5
       correct?
 6
            Α.
                 Yes.
 7
                 And did y'all live together -- how long
       did y'all live together as man and wife?
 8
 9
            Α.
                 Four years.
                 So, approximately, sometime in 1998,
10
            Ο.
       y'all were no longer living together; is that
11
12
       correct?
                 Yes, sir.
1.3
            Α.
                Do you know approximately what time frame
14
       that would be?
15
16
            Α.
                 I want to say July.
17
                 July of 1998?
            Q.
18
            A. Yes, sir.
19
                 What event caused you two to stop living
20
       together, if anything?
21
                 There was an argument. Normally, there's
22
       always an argument when he's drunk. And I didn't
       want to subject my kids to it any longer, so I took
23
```

my kids and left, as I had done before. We would

stay gone an hour or so. And when we would come

24

back, he's normally passed out or asleep. When we came back that night, I remember it was raining and the lock on the front door was changed. And so we went to the back door, and it was changed as well. And the windows, we couldn't get in the windows, and he wouldn't let us in. So I left. And my kids and I stayed at a hotel for two weeks, and I didn't go back. I've never been back.

- Q. So from that point, did you -- I believe you said it was July of 1998?
  - A. I believe it was.
- Q. Okay. You made a decision to separate from Mr. Minnifield?
  - A. Yes, sir.

.3

- Q. Now, what I want to do at this point is talk to you about the events that have occurred since your separation with Mr. Minnifield, if it was July, of '98 -- whatever date -- since your separation with him. Can you remember, approximately, the first contact that you had with him after your separation?
- A. Yes, sir. After living in a hotel for two weeks, I found an apartment in Brookview

  Apartments. I believe it was the beginning of October. The first incident was where he came to

the apartment with a co-worker of mine, and I wouldn't answer the door. I think he questioned some of the kids that were in the courtyard as of where we were living, and they told him. And I wouldn't open the door. Thereafter, one of my neighbors came around and said, He's doing something to your car, but I'm not sure what he's doing. And he had entered the car --

THE COURT: Now, wait just a moment.

You can't testify to something you didn't

personally observe or that someone told you in

regard to that. Just what you did. Go ahead.

THE WITNESS: Okay.

- Q. If you could, just tell me what you personally observed or saw or heard from the defendant.
- A. Okay. I called the police because I didn't know what was going on. When the police arrived, I went outside with the police and actually saw them -- I opened the hood, and they said that my wires had been disconnected. My co-worker was still there, and he said that John had disconnected the wires.

THE DEFENDANT: Object to that.

THE COURT: Again, you can't go into

what a co-worker said. You can only testify to what you saw and observed.

THE WITNESS: Okay.

- A. When I went out with the police, we noticed that my husband was coming back into the apartment complex. And I pointed out that that was my husband, and the police stopped him and talked with him and asked him not to come back into the complex. That was the first incident.
- Q. Okay. And after that incident, were there any more incidents that you would describe as harassing or bothersome to you?
  - A. Yes.

- Q. Can you tell us about those?
- A. I was taking one of my neighbors to pick up his son in Millbrook one morning.
- Q. Do you know, approximately, when this might be that you're telling us about? What year?
- A. It was '98. I believe it was early October.
  - Q. Okay,
- A. And encountered Mr. Minnifield riding on the bypass. At first, I didn't see him. And when I saw him, then he recognized me, and he proceeded to follow us from the northern bypass all the way

'5

1.3

to the Millbrook exit -- not the Millbrook exit -- 65 North. He tried to run us off the road several times.

- Q. Okay. When you said he tried to run you off the road several times, tell us -- you know, if you can paint a picture for the jury exactly what was happening?
- A. First of all, I was in the lane to go downtown because he was in the I-65 lane to exit. Then he switched over behind me, and so I immediately switched over to 65 because I didn't want him to follow me. He came back over. A truck ran off the ravine as an act of that. I went on up to I-65 North, and he came in an incident of two or three different times maybe two feet from my car. And he was yelling out of the window, I'm going to get you. I'm going to kill you. And I was just like, Leave me alone. Leave me alone.

The only thing I could do, there's one turn that you can turn off. Before you go to Millbrook, there's nowhere you can turn off, and I hit brakes real fast and spun into the median, and that's the only way I got away from him. And I went straight to the police department.

Q. And at that time, did you sign a warrant

1 on him? 2 Yes, sir. Okay. I want to show you what's been 3 marked as State's Exhibit No. 1. I'm going to ask 4 you if you can identify this item. 5 6 (Showed defendant the exhibit.) Once again, I'm going to show you what's 7 Ο. been marked as State's Exhibit No. 1, and ask you 8 9 if you can identify this document? 10 Α. Yes, sir. Okay. If you would, just take a minute 11 and look at that document. And I believe there's 12 13 two pages there. 14 (Witness complies.) 15 Okay. Can you tell the ladies and gentlemen of the jury what that document is? 16 17 Α. It's a reckless endangerment charge, 18 exactly what I just stated. 19 Q. Okay. And is that something that you 20 filled out? 21 Α. Yes, sir. Okay. And where did you fill that out 22 Q. 23 at? 24 At the city police department. Α. 25 So is that the report that you filled out Q.

```
1.
        at the city police department?
  2
                  Yes, sir, it is.
                  And does that have the date that you
 3
 4
        filled that report out?
 5
             Α.
                  Yes, sir.
 6
             Q.
                  And what is that date?
 7
             Α.
                 November.
                 Okay. Does it have the day?
 8
             Q.
 9
            Α.
                  14th.
10
            Q.
                  And year?
11
            Α.
                  198.
12
                 And in that document, does it spell out
            Q.
13
       basically what you have told the ladies and
       gentlemen of the jury about that incident?
14
15
            Α.
                 Yes, sir.
16
                 Now, if I could take this back for just a
17
       second?
            The document that you've identified as the
18
       report that you gave to the police, did anything
19
       ever happen with this? Was a case ever filed or
20
21
       anything like that?
22
                 I think he was charged with it. So much
      has happened, I can't remember what he was charged
23
      with or what he wasn't. I believe he was charged
24
25
      with it.
```

1 MR. BAILEY: Your Honor, at this time, we would move to admit State's Exhibit No. 1. 2 It's a certified document from the municipal court 3 signed by the administrator. 5 THE COURT: Okay. Admitted. (State's Exhibit No. 1 was admitted 7 into evidence.) 8 MR. BAILEY: Can I publish this to the jury, Your Honor? 9 Q. Okay. Ms. Minnifield, you've testified 10 about this reckless endangerment. Are there any 11 other events that have occurred between you and 12 Mr. Minnifield since your separation? 13 14 Yes, sir. There was one time when he 15 came to my apartment and --16 Can you give me a time frame? Q. 17 It was -- I believe it was October 29th of '98. He came to my door. It was around 9:30. 18 19 And he asked to come in, and I told him no. He 20 stated that he wanted a vacuum cleaner that he had bought for me previously. I told him I didn't have 21 a problem with giving it back, but I wasn't going 22 to open my door. I would take it to the accounting 23 firm where he worked the next morning, and he could 24 pick it up from there. And he left. Thereafter, 25

he came back around eleven, and he knocked again.

This time he was --

THE DEFENDANT: Object to that, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Overruled. Go ahead.

- Q. Okay. You said he came back around eleven?
  - A. Around eleven.

- Q. Is this a.m. or p.m.?
- A. This is p.m. This is at night. Around that time, I had just finished cooking dinner for the next day, and the girls and I were in bed. I told him I wasn't going to open the door. He said he only wanted the vacuum cleaner and that was it. I told him I didn't feel comfortable. I would drop it by his office. He left.

He came back at 12:30, and he was irate. He sounded to be drunk, because I can tell when he's drunk. He said that if I didn't open the door, he was going to come through the window. Well, we only have one bedroom at the time, and my baby girl was in there. So I woke her up and asked her to come in the hallway so if glass started flying, she wouldn't get hurt. I told her to put some clothes on because I could feel like something was going to

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

1.5

16

17

18

19

20

21

. 22

23

24

25

happen. He was escalating. He asked me again to open the door, and I wouldn't.

At that time, he kicked my front door and the chain caught it. He kicked it a second time, and he kicked the door in. And when he came in, my oldest daughter grabbed a hammer out of a drawer and before she could do anything, he slapped her to the ground. She had just had scoliosis surgery, like, three months before.

My youngest daughter got in between -- John came up to me and grabbed me, and I was holding him. He was holding me. I was trying to keep him away from the girls. I was yelling at them to run out the front door and get help. My youngest daughter got in between the two of us, and she was saying, Don't hurt my mom. And my oldest daughter got in between them, and it pushed me farther away from him, and I couldn't no longer hold his hands. And the next thing I remember is he said, I have something for all of y'all. And he reached in his back right pocket, and I thought what I thought was a gun, and I pushed my girls out -- to go out the door, but they wouldn't leave me. My youngest daughter got pushed into the bedroom. And my oldest daughter got pushed back into the living

1	room. And he pulled out a hatchet and everything
2	just happened from there. I told my oldest
. 3	daughter to run out the door and keep help.
4	THE COURT: We need more question
, 5	and answer.
6	Q. Okay. You said he pulled out a hatchet.
7	Can you describe that for us?
8	A. It was about twelve inches long.
9	Q. Okay. Did it have a blade on it?
10	A. Yes, sir, it did.
11	Q. After he pulled out the hatchet, what did
12	he do?
13	A. I tried to close the bedroom door. My
14	youngest daughter ran into the bathroom that was in
15	the bedroom and locked herself in. He came in the
16	room. He and I struggled, and we I was trying
17	to hold him. And, eventually, he ended up throwing
18	me through the bedroom window.
19	Q Okay. During the time that these events
20	were occurring, was he saying anything to you?
21	A. Yeah, like, I'm going to kill you. Who's
22	in here? I'm going to kill you. That's about it.
23	And he went to the bathroom door after he
24	threw me through the window. And after he saw it

was my youngest daughter in there, he said, I'm not

going to hurt you. It's not you I want to hurt, but you better come out before I change my mind.

And she just couldn't move, and I told her to jump out the window.

- Q. Which daughter was that?
- A. Ashley, my youngest.

7.

- Q. As a result of him pushing you out the window, did you incur any injuries?
  - A. I had cuts, minor cuts.
- Q. Once he pushed you through the window, were you on the outside of the house?
- A. I was. My youngest daughter, I begged her to jump out after he let her out of the bathroom. My oldest daughter came back in the room to see what had happened. And then he pulled the hatchet up at her saying he was going to kill her as well. And I begged her to jump through the window. And as she jumped through, he swung the hatchet at her. She had to get stitches. She got cut as well.
  - Q. What happened then?
- ${\bf A}$ . The girls ran to a -- a neighbor was begging them to come inside. She took the girls inside.
  - Q. Do you know that neighbor's name?